Amplified upward trend of the joint occurrences of heat and ozone extremes in China over 2013–2020

Xiang Xiao,a Yangyang Xu,b Xiaorui Zhang,a Fan Wang,a Xiao Lu,c Zongwei Cai,d Guy Brasseur,e Meng Gao*a,d,f

a Department of Geography, Hong Kong Baptist University, Hong Kong, China
b Department of Atmospheric Sciences, Texas A&M University, College Station, TX, USA
c School of Atmospheric Sciences, Sun Yat-sen University, Guangzhou, China
d State Key Laboratory of Environmental and Biological Analysis, Hong Kong Baptist University, Hong Kong, China
e Atmospheric Chemistry Observation & Modeling Laboratory, National Center for Atmospheric Research, Boulder, CO, USA
f Hong Kong Branch of Southern Marine Science and Engineering Guangdong Laboratory (Guangzhou), Hong Kong, China

* Corresponding author: Meng Gao, mmgao2@hkbu.edu.hk

Early Online Release: This preliminary version has been accepted for publication in Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society, may be fully cited, and has been assigned DOI 10.1175/BAMS-D-21-0222.1. The final typeset copyedited article will replace the EOR at the above DOI when it is published.

© 2022 American Meteorological Society
ABSTRACT

Climate change and air pollution are two intimately interlinked global concerns. The frequency, intensity and duration of heatwaves are projected to increase globally under future climate change. A growing body of evidence indicates that health risks associated with the joint exposure to heatwaves and air pollution can be greater than that due to individual factors. However, the co-occurrences of heat and air pollution extremes in China remain less explored in the observational records. Here we investigate the spatial pattern and temporal trend of frequency, intensity, and duration of co-occurrences of heat and air pollution extremes using China’s nationwide observations of hourly PM$_{2.5}$ and O$_3$, and the ERA5 reanalysis dataset over 2013–2020. We identify a significant increase in the frequency of co-occurrence of wet-bulb temperature (T$_w$) and O$_3$ exceedances (beyond a certain predefined threshold), mainly in the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei (BTH) region (up by 4.7 days decade$^{-1}$) and the Yangtze River Delta (YRD). In addition, we find that the increasing rate (compared to the average levels during the study period) of joint exceedance is larger than the rate of T$_w$ and O$_3$ itself. For example, T$_w$ and O$_3$ co-extremes increased by 7.0% in BTH, higher than the percentage increase of each at 0.9% and 5.5%, respectively. We identify same amplification for YRD. This ongoing upward trend in the joint occurrence of heat and O$_3$ extremes should be recognized as an emerging environmental issue in China, given the potentially larger compounding impact to public health.

CAPSULE (BAMS ONLY)

We identify a significant increase in joint occurrences of heat and O$_3$ extremes, and the increasing rate of joint is larger than the rate of T$_w$ and O$_3$ itself.
1. Introduction

Global warming and ambient air pollution are two leading global public health concerns, driven by anthropogenic emissions of greenhouse gases and air pollutants from fossil fuel uses (Pachauri et al. 2014). It was estimated that the increase in global temperature would result in additional 250,000 deaths each year between 2030 and 2050 (Watts et al. 2015), while a recent assessment attributed 4.2 million premature deaths per year to ambient air pollution exposure (Cohen et al. 2017; WHO 2020). Climate change and air pollution are also intimately interlinked (Dean; Green 2018). A warming climate could directly alter meteorological variables, such as temperature, precipitation and wind (Sanderson et al. 2011), and thus further affects physical and chemical processes of air pollution [e.g., Ozone (O$_3$) and particulate matter ≤ 2.5μm, (PM$_{2.5}$)] over multiple spatiotemporal scales (Ebi; McGregor 2008; Kinney 2008; Xu et al. 2018). Climate change is also likely to indirectly change particulate matter (PM) levels by modulating the natural emission from the occurrences of wildfires and dust storms (Dean; Green 2018).

Compared to the mean conditions of weather and air pollution, extreme weather and air pollution events, despite rare occurrences, can pose greater threats to human health and induce larger devastation to ecosystems and economy (Field et al. 2012; Zhang et al. 2020). More concerning is that extreme air pollution episodes and heatwaves often occur simultaneously because they can be driven by some common meteorological conditions. For example, heatwaves, droughts and peak ozone episodes are usually associated with stagnant high-pressure systems (low precipitation, low wind speeds, sufficient solar radiation, etc.) that tend to accumulate heat and ozone precursors in a certain location. Moreover, complex interactions and feedbacks could happen to exacerbate extreme conditions. For example, high temperature during heatwaves enhances biogenic emissions of volatile organic compounds (BVOCs) to increase production of O$_3$ and secondary organic aerosols (Karl et al. 2003). Under drought stress, stomatal uptake by plants is inhibited to reduce water loss, leading to a weaker dry deposition of O$_3$ and thus its higher surface concentrations (Gerosa et al. 2009; Lin et al. 2020).
Given that heat waves (Beniston 2004; Meehl and Tebaldi 2004; Stott et al. 2004; Fischer et al. 2007; Cowan et al. 2014; Schär 2016; Hoegh-Guldberg et al. 2018) and air pollution episodes (Mickley et al. 2004; Tagaris et al. 2007; Wu et al. 2008; Gao et al. 2013; Rieder et al. 2015; Schnell et al. 2016; Doherty et al. 2017; Schnell and Prather 2017; Chen et al. 2019) may aggravate over the coming decades, it is of great significance to analyze the historical trends of co-occurrence of heatwave and air pollution extremes, which would shed lights on the fidelity of their future projections. Another imperative to understand the co-occurrence of heatwave and air pollution extremes is driven by the recognitions that the simultaneous exposure to both air pollution and heatwave may amplify the health consequences beyond the sum of individual effects (Basu 2009; Dear et al. 2005; Kan et al. 2012; Li et al. 2014; Ren et al. 2008; Stafoggia et al. 2008; Wang et al. 2020a; Willers et al. 2016; Zanobetti; Peters 2015).

Over the recent decade, air pollution, particularly the high PM$_{2.5}$ levels, have raised wide concerns in China (Gao et al. 2020a; Gao et al. 2020b; Liang et al. 2017), and the State Council of China announced its strictest plan, the Air Pollution Prevention and Control Plan, in September 2013 (Zhang et al. 2019) to reduce the level of air pollutants. Since then, a decreasing trend of PM$_{2.5}$ levels have been found in both satellite and ground-level observations (Lin et al. 2018; Wang et al. 2020b; Wang et al. 2021). Despite of the overall decreasing trend, PM$_{2.5}$ concentrations during some pollution episodes can still exceed the threshold recommended by the World Health Organization (WHO) or local standards adopted in China (Wang et al. 2020b). Notably, while the concentrations of most primary pollutants have been decreasing in response to the emission control plan, surface O$_3$ concentrations have been increasing in several populated regions of China (Liu; Wang 2020; Lu et al. 2020; Wang et al. 2020b), and is projected to increase (Zhu and Liao, 2016). Nevertheless, the variability and recent trend of the joint frequency of all three detrimental environmental stressors (PM$_{2.5}$, O$_3$, and heat extremes) have not been extensively explored in China. Here we present a series of spatiotemporal analyses based on various sources of observations from 2013 to 2020 (Section 2). The observationally based results here would be crucial to enhancing environmental protection measures and informing public health policies in the future (Chen et al. 2018; Xu et al. 2020).
2. Methods

2.1 Data Sources of PM$_{2.5}$, O$_3$ and Temperature

Nationwide observations of hourly PM$_{2.5}$ and O$_3$ concentrations from year 2013 to 2020 were obtained from the China National Environmental Monitoring Center (CNEMC) network. Starting from 2013 in 74 major cities, the CNEMC network now consists of more than 1600 monitoring sites, covering 367 cities in China. PM$_{2.5}$ and O$_3$ were reported in unit of μg/m$^3$. Daily mean values of PM$_{2.5}$ were calculated from hourly record. Daily maximum 8-hour average (MDA8) of O$_3$ were calculated as well. Hourly temperature and corresponding dew point temperature were taken from the ERA5 reanalysis dataset by the European Centre for Medium-Range Weather Forecasts (ECMWF) (Hersbach et al. 2020). Both temperature and dew point temperature from ERA5 were sampled at CNEMC sites to examine co-occurrences.

2.2 Definition of heat extremes using Wet-Bulb Temperature

Previous studies suggested that a combination of temperature and humidity is a better metric to assess heat-related health risks (Kovats; Hajat 2008; Mora et al. 2017; Xu et al. 2020), as human body is less able to cool itself efficiently by sweating under high humidity conditions. We adopted wet-bulb temperature (T$_w$) in this study as the metric to define occurrences of heatwaves (Sherwood 2018). The calculation of T$_w$ assumes light wind speed and moderate radiation (Knutson; Ploshay 2016; Willett; Sherwood 2012), and thus only accounts for temperature (T) and humidity measures. In this study, we computed T$_w$ using Stull (2011)’s method:

$$T_w = T \cdot \text{atan} \left[0.151977 \left(100 \cdot RH + 8.313659 \right)^{2} + \text{atan} \left(T + 100 \cdot RH \right) - \text{atan} \left(100 \cdot RH - 1.676331 \right) + 0.003921838 \left(100 \cdot RH \right)^{2} \cdot \text{atan} \left(0.023101 \cdot 100 \cdot RH \right) - 4.686035 \right]$$

where T$_w$ denotes the wet-bulb temperature (°C), T the temperature (°C), RH the relative humidity. Because ERA5 provides dew-point temperature only, RH was calculated by the following equation:

$$e_s = e_0 \cdot \exp \left(\frac{L_e}{R_w} \left(\frac{1}{T_0} - \frac{1}{T} \right) \right), \quad e_{dew} = e_0 \cdot \exp \left(\frac{L_e}{R_w} \left(\frac{1}{T_0} - \frac{1}{T_{dew}} \right) \right), \quad RH = \frac{e_{dew}}{e_s} \cdot \frac{p-e_s}{p-e_{dew}} \times$$
100%, (2)

where $e_0$ represents the reference water vapor pressure (611 Pa), and $e_s$ and $e_{dew}$ signify the water vapor pressure at saturation and at dew point temperature, respectively. $T_0$ refers to the reference temperature (273 K). $T_{dew}$ denotes the dew point temperature. $L_v$ is the latent heat of water vaporization from liquid to gas ($2.5 \times 10^6$ J/kg), and $R_w$ represents the specific gas constant for water vapor (461.5 J/kg/K). Following Xu et al. (2020), we adopted daily average $T_w \geq 25 \, ^\circ C$ as the threshold for heat extremes.

2.3 Definition of air pollution extremes

We used the air quality standard of China (Zhao et al. 2016) for PM$_{2.5}$ and O$_3$, namely 75 µg/m$^3$ and 160 µg/m$^3$, as the cut-off values of exceedance. The days when daily mean $T_w$, daily mean PM$_{2.5}$, or MDA8 value for O$_3$, were higher than corresponding cut-off values, were marked as exceedance days for each metric. The days when two or more metrics exceed thresholds simultaneously were further marked as co-occurring extreme days. The numbers of exceedance days were summarized by months for further trend analyses.

In addition to number of exceedance days (i.e. frequency of extreme events), we also considered the duration and severity of these extremes (Xu et al. 2020). Duration was defined as the number of successive days of extreme events. The severity was defined as the difference between the long-term average and the corresponding levels within the exceedance days only.

2.4 Statistical Method for Trend Analyses

Previous studies have shown that heatwaves and O$_3$ extremes often occur in warm seasons while PM$_{2.5}$ is typically more severe in cold seasons in China (Jia et al. 2017; Lu et al. 2020; Zheng et al. 2005), we therefore quantify the trend of $T_w$ and O$_3$ during warm seasons only (six months from April to September), and for PM$_{2.5}$ we quantified the trend across the entire year. For the co-occurrence of $T_w$, O$_3$ and PM$_{2.5}$, we also used data during warm seasons. We assess the trends of monthly exceedance frequency (i.e., days per month) for heatwaves, PM$_{2.5}$ and O$_3$ from 2013 to 2020, explicitly accounting for seasonal cycles and autocorrelation.
(Chandler; Scott 2011; Lu et al. 2020), as detailed below.

Trend analyses were performed by constructing a generalized linear regression equation with periodic functions accounting for seasonal variation and an autoregression term accounting for autocorrelation within the study period, as follows:

\[ y_t = b + kt + \alpha \cos \left( \frac{2\pi M}{C} \right) + \beta \sin \left( \frac{2\pi M}{C} \right) + AR_t, \] 

where \( y_t \) represents the exceedance frequency for the metrics of \( T_w, \) PM2.5 and O3 in month \( t, \) \( t \) denotes the index of month during the study period of 8 years (ranging from 1 to 48 for \( T_w \) and O3, or 1 to 96 for PM2.5 alone), \( b \) denotes the intercept, \( k \) is the linear trend coefficient, \( \alpha \) and \( \beta \) are coefficients of periodic functions, \( M \) is the month index in each year (ranging from 1 to 6 for \( T_w \) and O3, or 1 to 12 for PM2.5 alone), \( C \) is the length of seasonal cycle (6 for \( T_w \) and O3, or 12 for PM2.5 itself) and \( AR_t \) is the autoregression term for \( y_t \). Non-parametric Mann-Kendall (M-K) test was performed to test the significance of linear trends.

2.5 Pooling to derive Regional Trend

Previous studies showed that the spatial distribution of O3 concentrations vary greatly across different regions in China (Lu et al. 2018). Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei (BTH) region, Yangtze River Delta (YRD) and Pearl River Delta (PRD) region are three major urban clusters with distinct pollution patterns (Liu et al. 2018; Ma et al. 2019). In this study, we calculated the aggregated/pooled trend of exceedances for \( T_w, \) O3 and PM2.5 as well as their joint occurrences in these three megacity clusters in China (BTH, YRD and PRD).

However, the methods to generate regional trend in previous studies using observation data from monitoring sites seem arbitrary as each monitoring site may have depicted different and even opposite trends. A synthetical statistical algorithm is thus needed to standardize the calculation of regional trend. Here we propose a pooling method to aggregate the trends calculated from all individual sites within a specific region. The site-specific local trend, notated as \( k_i \) in Section 2.4, are then pooled to estimate the average trend \( (K_r) \) representing a specific region following the equation of:

\[ K_r = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^{n} k_i w_i}{\sum_{i=1}^{n} w_i}, \]
where \( n \) is the number of sites within the region, and \( w_i \) is the weighting factor for each site, defined as follows, similar to meta-analysis (Lipsey; Wilson 2001), where the standard error \( SE_i \) represents the uncertainty of estimating \( k_i \)

\[
w_i = 1/SE_i^2, \quad (5)
\]

\( K_r \) is approximately normally distributed (Sánchez-Meca; Marin-Martínez 2010) and its sample variance could be defined as:

\[
Var(K_r) = 1/\sum_{i=1}^{n} w_i, \quad (6)
\]

3. Results and Discussion

3.1 Spatiotemporal variations and long-term trend of Tw, O3 and PM2.5 exceedances

Humidity has critical effects on human body’s reaction to temperature (Liu et al. 2014) as human body is not able to cool itself by sweating under high humidity. Using temperature only may underestimate the severity of heatwaves, especially in humid regions (Russo et al. 2017). In this study, we adopted 25 °C as the threshold of heat extremes as proposed by Mora et al. (2017), and note that 25 °C at a typical RH of 40% is very close to daily max temperature of 35 °C (Xu et al. 2020). Over the southeastern coastal regions, Tw exceedance days could reach as high as 150–180 days annually (Figure 1a and S1), suggesting high frequency of heatwaves there. The average Tw in China displays a slightly increasing trend, rising from 13.5 °C (standard deviation, SD: 5.6 °C) in 2013 to 13.8 °C (SD: 5.5 °C) in 2020 (Figure S2). Moreover, the severity of high Tw extremes could reach up to 3 °C (Figure S3) and the events (mean duration) could last about two months in southernmost part of China (Figure S4). Previously, Ding et al. (2010) and Wei; Chen (2011) reported a significant increase in heatwaves across the nation during recent decades, except for a slight decrease in central China. In the shorter period of the last decade as examined here, however, the trend of Tw exceedance can go in both directions across China (Figure 2). Overall, a clear positive trend could be found in mid-eastern and northeastern regions, on average, at rates of up to 1.4 days decade\(^{-1}\). In contrast, a decreasing trend, around 1.0 days decade\(^{-1}\) on average, is found in coastal and central areas of China.
Fig. 1. Average number of exceedance days per year for $T_w$ (a), $O_3$ (b) and PM$_{2.5}$ (c); locations of the sites in the BTH, PRD and YRD regions (d).

Fig. 2. Trend of $T_w$ (a), $O_3$ (b) and PM$_{2.5}$ (c) exceedance days. Both the angle and color are showing the negative trends (i.e., downward sloping arrows in blue color) and positive trends (i.e., upward sloping arrows in red color).

Occurrences of $O_3$ exceedance were concentrated in the BTH, YRD, and PRD (locations marked in Figure 1d), where intense human activities are located (Figure 1b). Exceedance days exhibited a general increase over 2013-2020 (up to 6.0 days decade$^{-1}$, Figure 2b), in line with the variations of $O_3$ levels (Figure S5 and S6). Despite that extremely high levels of MDA8 $O_3$ (i.e., $>30$ μg/m$^3$ above the threshold value) were becoming less frequent, the
modest exceedance (approximately 15~30 μg/m$^3$ above the threshold values) was observed in more sites in recent years (Figure S7). The increase in the mean duration of O$_3$ extremes (Figure S8) also highlighted the nation-wide spread of O$_3$ pollution, among which BTH area showed the most significant growth, consistent with previous studies (Li et al. 2017a). The BTH is severely polluted with respect to PM$_{2.5}$, and mean exceedance days generally reached over 60 days (Figure 1c). The number of exceedances of PM$_{2.5}$ reached a daunting 150 days per year in 2013 to 2016 (Figure S9), which improved gradually since 2015 (He et al. 2020; Wang et al. 2020b; Xue et al. 2020), with both lower PM$_{2.5}$ levels (Figure S10) and lower severity observed (Figure S11). PM$_{2.5}$ exceedance days decreased at the rate of more than 10 days decade$^{-1}$, with the largest decreasing trend observed in BTH area (Figure 2c).

3.2 Changes in the joint exceedance of $T_w$, $O_3$ and PM$_{2.5}$

Figure 3 displays the trends of joint exceedance frequency of $T_w$, $O_3$ and PM$_{2.5}$ over the 2013–2020 period. Here, we identify an alarming trend of co-occurrence of $T_w$ and $O_3$ extremes. High $T_w$ and $O_3$ extremes tend to increase in the study period, especially in the BTH and YRD regions (at a rate up to 4.0 days decade$^{-1}$). Among exceedance days, mean duration and severity of $T_w$ and $O_3$ co-occurrence, we observe similar spatiotemporal pattern, in which the rising trend of $T_w$ and $O_3$ is larger individually than jointly (absolute changes, Figure S13 and S14), and most of the upward trend is observed in BTH and YRD regions driven by the co-occurrence in mid-summer (June and July, figures not shown).
Fig. 3. Trend of co-occurrence of \( T_w \), \( O_3 \) and \( PM_{2.5} \) exceedance days over China. Co-occurrence of \( T_w \) and \( O_3 \) (a); co-occurrence of \( PM_{2.5} \) and \( O_3 \) (b), \( T_w \) and \( PM_{2.5} \) (c), \( T_w \), \( PM_{2.5} \) and \( O_3 \) (d). Both the angle and color are showing the negative trends (i.e., downward sloping arrows in blue color) and positive trends (i.e., upward sloping arrows in red color).

The co-occurrence of \( O_3 \) extremes during heatwaves has long been recognized in developed countries (Filleul et al. 2006; Lee et al. 2006), and the underlying reason behind the combination of the two risk factors may partially be their common favorable weather patterns. For example, atmospheric blocking was reported to enhance the probability of co-occurrences of \( O_3 \) and heat extremes (Otero et al. 2021). Under a warming climate, amplified atmospheric blocking events are likely to lead to more frequent joint occurrences of heat and \( O_3 \) extremes (Nabizadeh et al. 2019). During heatwaves, the stagnant condition, controlled by anti-cyclone with a sinking airflow, may lead to less cloud cover (Pu et al. 2017) and weaker surface winds (Li et al. 2017b), both of which are favorable for \( O_3 \) formation (Pyrgou et al. 2018). Besides, previous review has indicated that high temperatures could play a catalytic role in promoting chemical reactions of \( O_3 \) formation and enhancing natural emissions of \( O_3 \) precursors;
temperature is also associated with other synoptic patterns such as blocks and stagnation (Lu et al. 2019; Wang et al. 2017).

In addition, as important O₃ precursors, changes in anthropogenic emissions of NOₓ, CO and volatile organic compounds (VOCs) could also play a role in the observed patterns (Logan 1985; Lu et al. 2018; Qu et al. 2014). Previous numerical experiments suggested that NOₓ reductions and aerosol control measures were the major cause for enhanced O₃ in Beijing, while reductions of NOₓ and increase in VOCs emissions contributed to O₃ increase in Shanghai (Liu and Wang, 2020). Accordingly, effective strategies of VOCs emission control should be also considered in high priority (He et al. 2022).

The co-occurrence of T_w, PM₂.₅ and O₃ exceedance days had been decreasing at majority of sites, among which the greatest decreasing trend was observed in BTH (Figure 3d). The trend of duration of these co-extremes also showed a similar pattern (Figure S14). We observe that although PM₂.₅ increased at a small number of sites (Figure 2c), the joint occurrence of PM₂.₅ and O₃ is found to decrease at nearly all sites (Figure 3b). This is possibly associated with the fact that elevated PM₂.₅ levels would reduce O₃ levels due to aerosols’ influences on O₃ photochemistry and heterogeneous chemistry (Chen et al. 2020; Li et al. 2019).

In addition to the augmented cases (absolute changes) of co-occurrence of T_w and O₃, we ascertain in this study that the co-occurrence of T_w and O₃ have been increasing at higher percentage rates than the individual pace of each. As shown in Table 1, the exceedance days of T_w, and O₃ increased by 1.0 % decade⁻¹, 8.2 % decade⁻¹, respectively, while the joint exceedance of T_w and O₃ showed an augmented increase by 10.8 % decade⁻¹. Such an enhancement in the joint occurrences might be due to the abovementioned interaction between temperature and O₃ formation. Additionally, these numbers also indicate that although the co-occurrence of T_w and O₃ extremes was relatively rare in most cities, they have become more common in the recent years at a disproportionately larger rate.

Accepted for publication in Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society. DOI 10.1175/BAMS-D-21-0222.1.
Table 1. Average trends in percentage per decade (calculated with respect to the mean levels of each metric over the study period).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage change</th>
<th>Exceedance days</th>
<th>Mean duration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>All</td>
<td>BTH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$T_w$</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$O_3$</td>
<td>8.2%</td>
<td>5.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PM$_{2.5}$</td>
<td>-3.8%</td>
<td>-12.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$T_w$ &amp; $O_3$</td>
<td>10.9%</td>
<td>7.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$T_w$ &amp; PM$_{2.5}$</td>
<td>-29.0%</td>
<td>-26.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$O_3$ &amp; PM$_{2.5}$</td>
<td>-28.6%</td>
<td>-21.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$T_w$, $O_3$ &amp; PM$_{2.5}$</td>
<td>-24.8%</td>
<td>-22.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.3 Regional trend in BTH, YRD and PRD

Among the three regions, BTH showed the highest downward trend (-13.0 days decade$^{-1}$) in PM$_{2.5}$ exceedances, followed by YRD (-7.7 days decade$^{-1}$) and PRD (-4.6 days decade$^{-1}$) (Figure S15). Opposite trends were identified for $O_3$ exceedances, with BTH increasing at 11.4 days decade$^{-1}$, YRD increasing at 5.5 days decade$^{-1}$ and PRD increasing at 1.7 days decade$^{-1}$. The exceedance trends of $T_w$ were also positive, despite with a relatively smaller magnitude (0.9 days decade$^{-1}$ for BTH, 3.8 days decade$^{-1}$ for YRD and 4.3 days decade$^{-1}$ for PRD) (Figure S15).

Fig. 4. Pooling trends of co-occurrence of $T_w$, $O_3$ and PM$_{2.5}$ exceedance days in BTH (a) and YRD (b) regions.
Since the co-occurrences of $T_w$, $O_3$ and PM$_{2.5}$ were relatively rare in the PRD region, next we only report results for the BTH and YRD. In the BTH, the co-occurrence of $T_w$ and $O_3$ increased at 4.7 days decade$^{-1}$ (or relatively at 7.0%/decade) while all other combinations exhibited decreasing trends (Figure 4 and Figure 5a). Similar patterns are found in the YRD (Figure 4 and Figure 5b). Similarly, increasing trends of $T_w$ and $O_3$ severity and extreme duration were also identified in these two regions (Figure S16 and Figure S17). In BTH, we observe also that the exceedance days of $T_w$ and $O_3$ co-extremes increased by 7.0%, higher than the percentage of each of them (0.9% and 5.5%, respectively, Table 1). Same amplification is also identified for the YRD.

Fig. 5. Pooling trend of independent and joint occurrence of $T_w$, $O_3$ and PM$_{2.5}$ exceedance days in BTH (a), YRD (b).

3.4 Interpretation of the amplified trends

As there is no census on the definition of heatwaves around the globe. Previous studies that adopted various definitions of heatwaves have revealed differences of effect estimation under different definitions (Chen et al. 2015; Kent et al. 2014). Our study found that absolute changes in the rising trend of $T_w$ and $O_3$ is larger individually than jointly while the percentage rates showed the opposite pattern. This counterintuitive result may be partially due to the small number of co-occurrence as we used the mean values of each metrics to derive the percentage change. In addition, the uncertainty of percentage change might also exist when using other definitions of heatwave. But our sensitivity analysis (Figure S21 and Figure S22) revealed that the direction and significance remain robust when using different threshold.

Accepted for publication in Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society. DOI 10.1175/BAMS-D-21-0222.1.
values. The amplified trend of $T_w$ and $O_3$ we observed might be associated with multi-factors, such as urban growth, anthropogenic heat and PM$_{2.5}$ reduction. In addition, heatwaves trends were also suggested to be associated with the local hydroclimate (Liao et al. 2018). Further investigations are needed to understand the contributions of different factors to the observed amplified trend of $T_w$ and $O_3$. Another limitation of this study is that we used the fixed-effect model to obtain the average trend estimates in specific regions. The fixed-effect model made an assumption that the weight of trend in each site is simply determined by the corresponding variance residuals (lower indicating better model performance) of trend regression model. Other factors such as geographical and meteorological conditions (such as elevation and wind speed) of each site cannot be considered.

4 Conclusion

In the trend pooling analyses, we used a strategy to assess the overall trend of a particular region. The results are not sensitive to outliers in the time series of data. We first followed the trend analyses method proposed and used in previous studies (Chandler; Scott 2011; Cochrane; Orcutt 1949; Weatherhead et al. 1998), and then we combined the trend within regions by using a standard error-based weighting method. The results are consistent with previous studies. For example, contrasting trends of PM$_{2.5}$ and surface $O_3$ concentrations were observed among all of the three regions (Wang et al. 2020b). In addition, we also found that the severity of ozone pollution (difference between mean concentration and its threshold value) was also on the rise.

BTH, YRD and PRD are the three major city clusters in China and several studies have indicated that, in urban areas of these region, ozone formation is mainly VOC-limited or mixed-limited (Geng et al. 2009; Qu et al. 2014; Shao et al. 2009). For mixed-limited regions, it has been suggested that both decreasing NO$_x$ levels and increasing VOCs levels could enhance ozone pollution (Lu et al. 2018). Furthermore, dealing with warming temperature and ozone pollution may have some co-benefits due to the relationship between temperature and ozone formation as discussed above as well as the fact that tropospheric ozone is a potent greenhouse gas. Therefore, cooperation in policies regarding warming climate and urban
ozone pollution is warranted and further studies are needed to quantify the effect of emission control measures on both climate change and air pollution.

We conclude that China has achieved success in mitigating particulate matter pollution, as reduction in average concentration level, and in the frequency, duration and severity of exceedance events have been observed. However, the widespread ozone pollution and warming temperature as well as the less-recognized co-occurrence of these two conditions are on the rise across the country. These two damaging factors for public health and ecosystems (Chen et al. 2007; Rossati 2017) should be seen as an emerging alarming issue. Further investigation on both aspects is needed to develop control strategies that effectively mitigate the ongoing trend and avoid undesired consequences.

Acknowledgments

We acknowledge the European Centre for Medium-Range Weather Forecasts (ECWMF) for providing the ERA5 reanalysis datasets. This work was sponsored by Research Grants Council of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, China (project no. HKBU22201820).

Data Availability Statement

All the data presented can be accessed through contacting the corresponding authors.
REFERENCES


Ebi, K. L., and G. McGregor, 2008: Climate change, tropospheric ozone and particulate matter, and


Gao, M., and Coauthors, 2020a: China's emission control strategies have suppressed unfavorable influences of climate on wintertime PM 2.5 concentrations in Beijing since 2002. Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics, 20, 1497-1505.


Jia, M., and Coauthors, 2017: Inverse relations of PM2.5 and O3 in air compound pollution between cold and hot seasons over an urban area of east China. Atmosphere, 8, 59.


Qu, Y., J. An, J. Li, Y. Chen, Y. Li, X. Liu, and M. Hu, 2014: Effects of NOx and VOCs from five emission sources on summer surface O3 over the Beijing-Tianjin-Hebei region. *Advances in Atmospheric Sciences*, 31, 787-800.


Wei, K., and W. Chen, 2011: An abrupt increase in the summer high temperature extreme days across China in the mid-1990s. *Advances in Atmospheric Sciences, 28*, 1023-1029.


Willers, S. M., and Coauthors, 2016: High resolution exposure modelling of heat and air pollution and 22

Accepted for publication in *Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society*. DOI 10.1175/BAMS-D-21-0222.1.


